The Relationships between Leadership Behavior and Employees’ Motivation, Organizational Commitment, and Job Satisfaction in Retail Stores

Thitisak Duadsuntla¹ and Amnaj Theeravanich²

¹Graduate Student, MBA in Industrial Development and Administration, Faculty of Management Science, Kasetsart University
²Associate Professor, Faculty of Management Science, Kasetsart University

ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to examine the relationship between leadership behaviors and employees’ motivation, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction of salespersons in retail stores (convenience and grocery stores) distributed in the area of Chonburi Province in Thailand. A quantitative research design was used. Using an evaluation of the literature and confirmatory study, appropriate constructs and instruments were developed and then distributed to approximately 450 salespersons. The questionnaires returned from the target samples were 421, which constituted 93.56 percent of the return rate. The findings of the study indicated that: 1) there was a positive relationship between consideration and initiating structure leadership behavior, and all the subscales of organizational commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction; 2) the initiating structure leadership behavior had higher potentiality to predict employees’ work motivation, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction than the consideration leadership behavior did, specifically in the retail stores.

Keywords: Leadership Behavior / Motivation / Organizational Commitment / Job Satisfaction / Retail Stores

Introduction

The emphasis of leadership research shifted from traits to behavior, and this resulted in the contrasting notion that leader behaviors could be identified and trained for development purpose (Mendenhall, 2013). The early investigation of leadership behaviors included a separation of those behaviors into relation-oriented and task-
oriented categories (Nguyen & Mujtaba, 2011). Consideration (people-related behavior) and initiation of structure (task-related behavior) are forms of leadership behaviors that were first identified in Ohio State Leadership studies initiated by C.L. Shartle in 1945 (Halpin, 1957). According to the studies, leaders who fall within the consideration dimension were typically concerned with the overall welfare of the members of the group in which they lead, and they usually express appreciation to workers for their tasks well, stress importance of job satisfaction, help maintain the self-esteem of subordinates prior to making decisions, considerate leaders focus on creating trust, friendship, and interpersonal warmth (Bass and Stogdill, 1990). On the contrary, leaders who operate within the initiating structure dimension initiate, organize, and define work-related activities of subordinates since their focus is on task accomplishment, meeting deadlines, deciding on what will be done and who will do it. In fact, they have hands-on style of leadership (Bass and Stogdill, 1990).

The present study is built on those research that emphasize the two predominant areas of leadership which includes "task" and "people". Although they are occasionally linked or related to other terms such as transformational and transactional, relations-oriented and task-oriented, leadership and management, respectively (Nguyen & Mujtaba, 2011), consideration and initiating structure are used in the present study since these terms are the most influential research in leadership behavior pioneered in 1950s and 1960s at the Ohio State University, and much of research on leadership behavior has followed the pattern of instrument called Leader Behavior Description Questionnaire (LBDQ) which was established through one of the projects of leadership studies at the university (Lambert et al., 2012).

While a number of literature has revealed the influence of leadership styles on subordinates or employees and even customer satisfaction, those are mostly conducted in non-retail business setting and in more complex and large organizations. The studies of leadership behaviors (initiating structure and consideration) in relation to the human factors such as subordinates' motivation, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction are rarely found especially in Thailand and in retail business setting. It is still ambiguous about how subordinates view their store managers/owners in this context. In addition, the levels of subordinates' motivation, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction in such context are still questionable. As a consequence, the current study aims at fulfilling the literature of leadership behaviors especially in retail trade context.

Small and Medium Enterprises (SMEs) play a significant role in overall Thai economy. At the end of 2012, it made up 98.5% of the total businesses (OSMEP, 2012). Its workforce constitutes the employment figure of 80.4% of the total. The highest hiring rates were found in Bangkok, Samutprakarn, and Chonburi with its rates at 24.2%, 4.3%, and 3.1% respectively. These businesses were attributable to the increase in Thailand's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) for 2012 of 11.37 trillion baht which represented a 6.5% growth over 2011. Among those businesses, one of the largest sectors is found in retail business. However, these firms have been facing challenges due to complexity and uncertainty of society. Undoubtedly, Thai retail industry is undergoing
change and competition get tougher with unexpected factors. Hence, flexibility for unexpected change has become a key for retaining sustainable growth. Managers in these organizations have a substantial role as they are involved with visions to inspire their employees, to improve staff satisfaction and motivation, and ultimately increase customer satisfaction (Kantabutra, 2012). Indeed, they are involved in management processes and ability to influence others in an organization toward the achievement of organizational objectives.

Mosadeghrad & Ferdosi (2013) indicated that commitment as an outcome has been related to leadership. They asserted that leadership and commitment were closely interrelated. Their study highlights a crucial role of leadership on employees' commitment. Organizational commitment resulted from major factors including personality, job specialty, pay and working experience (Raja and Palanichamy, 2011). Then the outcome of commitment includes retention, willingness, retention demand, attending rate, and performance. The leaders can encourage their employees' commitment to organization with their leadership styles for the successful implementation of business strategies to achieve organizational goal. In these processes, commitment acts as a mediating role of leader member exchange and conflict between leaders and subordinate can be reduced when culture reflects employee value (Sabir et al., 2011). If the management of organization tries to satisfy the need of its employees, the commitment of the employees will increase and remain as a part of organization (Hamdia and Phadett, 2011) when the confidence and trust on the leader occur (Sabir et al., 2011). The increase of commitment might result from properly designed job which contains relationships of tasks and reorganization of employees. This creates satisfaction, motivation and finally leads to organization commitment (Belias & Kouetelios, 2014) and employees produce positive behaviors toward the job when job is challenging and meaningful to them (Berg, Dutton, & Wrzesniewski, 2013).

Likewise, a number of research revealed positive relationship between the leadership and work motivation. For instance, Eyal and Roth (2011) studied the relationship between educational leadership styles including transformational and transactional styles and teachers' motivation, and the results found that the leadership styles among school principals play a significant role in teachers' motivation and well-being. In short, it can be generalized based on the research in distinctive settings that leadership contributes to the higher work motivation among employees and partners.

Additionally, there are significant positive relationships between leadership behavior and job satisfaction (Ayhan, Yilmaz, & Senzul, 2013; Voon, Ngi, & Ayob, 2011). Yaghoubipoor, Tee & Ahmed (2013) asserted that the dominant leadership style practiced in the industry was transformational style. Different employees job satisfaction components were impacted in different ways depending on the leadership styles. Similarly, Piccolo et al. (2012) found that consideration style was more strongly related to follower satisfaction (leader satisfaction, job satisfaction), motivation, and leader effectiveness, while initiating structure was slightly more strongly related to leader job performance and group-organization performance.
Objective

The purpose of the study was to investigate the relationship between two main dimensions of leadership behavior (initiating structuring and consideration) and employees, work motivation, organizational commitment, and job satisfaction. The conceptual framework can be illustrated as follow.

Conceptual Framework

![Conceptual Framework Diagram]

Hypotheses:

- **H1**: Initiating Structure leadership behavior will be positively related to employees' organizational commitment.
- **H2**: Consideration leadership behavior will be positively related to employees' organizational commitment.
- **H3**: Initiating Structure leadership behavior will be positively related to employees' motivation.
- **H4**: Consideration leadership behavior will be positively related to employees' motivation.
- **H5**: Initiating Structure leadership behavior will be positively related to employee's job satisfaction.
- **H6**: Consideration leadership behavior will be positively related to employees' job satisfaction.

Research Methodology

A quantitative research design used a paper-based survey as a primary research tool. Since the exact number of salespersons in the retail stores was inaccessible, according to Yamane's (1970), a sample size of at least 400 was considered appropriate for this study. The proposed samples were then selected with the convenience sampling technique.

Research Instruments

The questionnaire was developed underlying on different concepts and theories of leadership behavior (initiating structure), organizational commitment (affective, continuance, and normative), work motivation (intrinsic and extrinsic motivation), and Job satisfaction (work, quality of supervision, relationships with co-workers, promotion opportunities, and pay). It consisted of two main parts. The first part elicited the demographic information including age, gender, marital status, time spent on the immediate managers/owners, and the total tenure. The latter part aimed to investigate leadership behavior (30 items), organizational commitment (18 items), work motivation (30 items), and job satisfaction (20 items). The validity was conducted using the Item Objective Congruence, and the overall values of the experts’ opinions on each item ranged from 0.80 to 1.00. The reliability levels of instruments obtained through the try-out process was represented by the Cronbach’s alpha coefficients as .937, .918, .923, and .927 respectively.

Data collection

The data were collected by distributing questionnaires to the target participants who were
salespersons in small retail stores throughout Chonburi Province, Thailand from late June to July 2014. The total of 450 questionnaires were distributed, and 421 of them (93.56%) were returned.

**Data Analysis**

To show the results of demographic data, the percentage (%) was used whereas the mean (X) and standard deviation (S.D) were utilized to present the levels of both dependent and independent variables shown in the hypotheses. Ultimately, simple regression analysis was employed to test the relationship of each pair of independent and dependent variables. The Beta (b), Adjusted R Square, and p-value were reported as shown in Table 1.

**Results**

Table 1 presents the results of hypothesis testing. This indicates the relationships of consideration and initiating leadership behaviour on organizational commitment, motivation, and job satisfaction. The dependent variables were regressed onto both independent variables. The results derived from simple regression analysis are shown as follow.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Model</th>
<th>Commitment (b)</th>
<th>Motivation (b)</th>
<th>Job Satisfaction (b)</th>
<th>Sig</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Initiating structure</td>
<td>.32**</td>
<td>.61**</td>
<td>.53**</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R Square</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td>.48</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Consideration style</td>
<td>.30**</td>
<td>.22**</td>
<td>.52**</td>
<td>.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjusted R Square</td>
<td>.16</td>
<td>.21</td>
<td>.27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: **significant at the level .01

H₁ and H₂ suggest that initiating structure and consideration was positively related to the presence of organizational commitment. Table 1 shows that the data to support these hypotheses and reports the detailed information regarding the regression analyses performed at the 0.01 level of significance. For the initiating structure, the relevant regression weight was (b = .321), and the overall Adjusted R square was .267, thus supporting H₁. For the consideration, the relevant regression weight was (b = .300), and the overall Adjusted R square was .155, thus supporting H₂.

H₃ and H₄ suggest that initiating structure and consideration was positively related to the presence of work motivation. Table 1 demonstrates the observed simple regression value between work motivation and leadership behavior. For the initiating structure, the relevant regression weight was (b = .611), and the overall Adjusted R square was .479, thus supporting H₃. For the consideration, the relevant regression weight was (b = .216), and the overall Adjusted R square was .214, thus supporting H₄.

H₅ and H₆ suggest that initiating structure and consideration was positively related to the presence of job satisfaction. Table 1 presents the data to support these hypotheses and reports the detailed information regarding the regression analyses performed at the 0.01 level of significance. For the initiating structure, the
relevant regression weight was \( b = .533 \), and the overall Adjusted R square was .417, thus supporting \( H_5 \). For the consideration, the relevant regression weight was \( b = .519 \), and the overall Adjusted R square was .265, thus supporting \( H_6 \).

**Discussion**

This paper has brought up some fundamental observations on leadership behavior, organizational commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction in retail stores. The results of the study can fulfill the knowledge of leadership studies obtained from a number of previous studies in which its objective is to contribute to the global business environment. Although the research on leadership has been conducted using similar underlying theory, this study addresses the characteristics of leadership in a particular setting of organization in which leadership behavior studies have been scarce.

Both initiating structure and consideration leadership behavior are beneficial for managers in small business retailing. It was found that initiating structure was more utilized in this type of organization in order to run the management process successfully. Most leaders need to provide clear direction, process, and coordination to the members of the organization for the purpose of attaining the organizational goals. This encompasses the “formal” part of leadership- setting the vision and mission for the organization, creating a process for achieving the goals (Robbins et. al., 2013). The results also imply that this type of leadership behavior should be emphasized in such type of organization since it shows superior influence on organizational commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction than consideration leadership behavior. It also shows higher relationship to the three dependent variables than the consideration behavior. Furnham (2012) stated that the high score on this dimension characterizes individuals who play more active role in directing group activities through planning, communicating information, scheduling and trying out news ideas. Leaders can be indirect predictor of improved staff and customer satisfaction by using their vision containing images about the leaders (Kantabutra, 2007). Therefore, retails stores managers should develop store vision as a part of their management.

Regarding the consideration leadership behavior, the findings suggest that, as stated above, this type of behavior showed much less effect on organizational commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction than initiating structure did. The results revealed that the leaders in this type of organization employed lower consideration behavior. This may mean that they may not put sufficient emphasis on personal or informal characteristics such as showing expertise, trust, caring, sharing, and morals, which would be perceived by their followers. The leaders tended to provide less opportunity for their followers to evaluate the credibility of, which help determine whether employees “willingly” accept and contribute their effort. This means that the leaders are likely to have lower relationship with their colleagues because they focus more on organizational goal accomplishment rather than concerning on followers’ feeling (Chang, 2011). As a result, they are likely to gain less trust from their followers because of low respect for those subordinates’ idea as well as consideration of their feeling even though they higher productivity is achieved. It is said that a high score is indicative of
a climate of good support and two-way communication. In contrast, a low score indicates the supervisor is likely to be more impersonal in these relations with group members. Furnham (2012) indicates that leader behavior which is higher in consideration is related to low turnover and few grievances, regardless of the amount of initiating structure the leader exhibited. One of the implications derived from the current study is that leaders need to practice more consideration behavior so that it can become closer to the degrees of the initiating structure since effective leadership is associated with high performance on both initiating structure and consideration (Jang & George, 2012).

Accordingly, leaders might have to balance between initiating structure and consideration in order to gain effectiveness. Too high or too low score on each side may lead to some problems especially those related to human resource management. For example, the way that the results indicating somewhat high score on initiating structure but low on consideration infer that the managers are likely to focus more upon efficiency and productivity. This can bring about job burnout which can result in lower effectiveness of employees, lower organizational commitment, higher absenteeism as well as turnover, and these factors are attributable to considerable drawbacks of an organization (Aydogdu & Aikgil, 2011). This is consistent with the results proposed by Loryon (2012), studied the level of job burnout in retail stores and explained that emotional exhaustion, depersonalization, and lack of personal accomplishment burnout was immediate level. In addition, employees with different demographic data were different in depersonalization, and lack of personal accomplishment.

To sum up, the managers have significant roles in increasing general competitive capabilities as well as enhancing employees’ effectiveness. Managers need to put an emphasis on both efficiency and consideration on the feeling and well-being of their followers since the consideration may have mediating effects between initiating structure and the outcomes such as commitment and job satisfaction. Indeed, managers should not ignore the formal aspects of leadership, initiating structure, while maintaining a strong focus on informal qualities which is referred to as consideration in this study.

Limitations

1. This research focused only on the relationships of leadership behavior on the organizational commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction. However, the relationships between the demographic factors, which were not emphasized in this study, may also have an influence on the level of the dependent variables.

2. The findings may not be generalized to more complex business organizations which might have different characteristics and patterns of management, operations, goods, and services.

3. There is limited access to the exact number of employees in the stores since some of them were not registered through the Department of Provincial Commerce, and some were relatives of the managers/owners. These factors possibly have an effect on the levels of commitment, work motivation, and job satisfaction.

Recommendations
This study found that although both types of leadership behaviors were positively related to the three dependent variables, it was found that initiating structure style of leader had higher effects when compared to consideration style of leader, especially in this group of participants. Further, the findings shed light on how managers should be developed in the retail business. It reveals that both leadership styles should be emphasized so that employees have higher organizational commitment, motivation and job satisfaction. This would be attributable to better work performance. However, further research should be conducted in more diverse types of organizations, industries, sectors, countries, and different demographical characteristics of samples.

References


